



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Bücherschau.

I. Erwiderung.*

Lawrence, Kas., Dec. 2nd, 1901.

Editor Pädagogische Monatshefte:

Anent Professor Heller's criticisms of Otis's *Elementary German* a few words of explanation and reply are called for. In the first place, it is due to both the gentlemen who are credited with revising the work to say that they were restricted by the necessity of maintaining the essential integrity of the plates as they were cast during the life of Professor Otis. While they were free to correct absolute misstatements, they were deterred from making what they regarded as merely improvements in the book as they found it, and if additions were thought necessary they could be made only at the expense of some matter already in the lessons, since the pagination could not be altered. Nevertheless, it is believed that there remain not more than the average number of errors in the book, though, of course, every individual teacher will wish that certain features were more according to his particular taste. Regarding the nature of the subject matter in the exercise, I agree with Professor Heller, that they lack naturalness and connectedness. Yet the excellencies of the little book are so many that it holds its own and will doubtless be welcomed in a thoroughly revised edition.

It seems to me that Professor Heller has sought far for errors. His first point, for instance, an objection to the statement that *ohne*, *um*, and *statt* are the only prepositions governing the infinitive, is groundless, or he has failed to make himself clear. If he knows of others, why not cite a few? And the illustrative sentence is entirely good. In the same paragraph, the inclusion of *um dass* among the conjunctions meaning 'in order that' is met with "horribile dictu!" This is severe on a phrase whose only offense is that of being archaic. The German sentences cited as not being "unimpeachable on the score of grammatic and idiomatic correctness" are most of them, I think, taken from good German authors, though I admit that they are not good models for modern colloquial German. '*Der Dogge*' in a sentence is probably a misprint, since the feminine article is given in the vocabulary just preceding. But does Professor Heller reject *der Dogge* altogether? Professor Heller's reference to 'P. 70' is probably an error for P. 270.

To declare that "*Mögen Sie die Musik?*" as an equivalent of the English "Are you fond of music?" is 'wrong', is quite too dogmatic, in view of the citations in Grimm's Dictionary, even if one's memory furnished no illustrations. It is true, however, that '*mögen*'—'like', 'be fond of' is more common in negative than in affirmative uses. Professor Heller declares that the double accusative after '*lehren*' is 'too uncommon to be quoted as a paradigm' (i. e. a model). Surely not. Let one who is in doubt examine the 19th century examples in Grimm's Dictionary.

It would have been a kindness if Professor Heller had pointed out the typographic errors alleged. A hasty examination has failed to reveal some of them, though they are doubtless there.

University of Kansas.

W. H. Carruth.

*) Vergleiche : „Deutschamerikanische Schulgrammatiken“. O. Heller. P. M. II. 10. Seite 373.